



Memorandum

Date June 1, 1983

From Office of Scientific and Health Reports, NIDR

Subject Comments on draft of fluoride health effects committee report

To Jay R. Shapiro
Deputy Director, The Clinical Center

On page 4, changes are marked in paragraph #1 to better define locations of high-fluoride public water supplies.

I discussed soft tissue fluoride concentrations with Dr. Frank Smith at Rochester. He is submitting a rewritten sentence as a replacement for the last sentence in paragraph #3 on page 5. I concur with his suggestions.

On page 8, in paragraph d., I have suggested a change simply for clarity in line 10: "protect against the risk of femoral fracture, and perhaps even increase that risk".

On page 11, in paragraph 7-c., it might be useful to point out that the intensity of the effects of the accumulation of fluoride in hard tissue is affected by the level of exposure and the consequent rate of accumulation, which partially explains the differences that may be found in the pathologies of bones having equal fluoride concentrations.

On page 14, in the discussion of cardiotoxic effects, "potential" seems a strong word for effects for which there is so little evidence. In this same paragraph, we state that severe dental fluorosis is a health effect to be avoided. I think we as a committee need to recognize that this is a departure from the conclusions reached through fifty years of PHS-sponsored epidemiological and clinical investigations. I too feel that moderate and severe dental fluorosis are to be avoided, but am less certain that we should invert history to accomplish that end.

The impending Federal regulatory action on fluoride in water that may draw its chief support from our findings will be subject to intense political opposition and probably will be the subject of court hearings. Where is our supporting evidence for the health effect of dental fluorosis? Which member will give our testimony?

For complete clarity, the last line on page 14 could be changed to read "intake from water with a fluoride concentration in excess of 5 ppm" etc.

John S. Small
Information Specialist
NIDR 496-4261