

The Effects of High Fluoride Intake on Child Mental Work Capacity and Preliminary Investigation into Mechanisms Involved

Li Yun, Li Xiaoji, Wei Siqiong

Child and Adolescent Hygienics Teaching and Research Section

Abstract: A study was carried out on 157 children, age 12-13, from a coal-burning, fluorosis endemic area, and an experiment looking into the effect of high fluoride intake in animals was included. The results show that early, prolonged high fluoride intake causes a decrease of a child's mental work capacity and that prolonged high uptake of fluoride causes a child's levels of hair zinc to drop. A multifactor correlative analysis demonstrates a direct correlation between hair zinc and mental work capacity. The decrease of 5-hydroxy-indole acetic acid and the increase of norepinephrine in animal brains exposed to high levels of fluoride suggest a possible mechanism for mental work capacity deficits in children, however more research is necessary.

Key words: Fluorosis Mental Work Capacity Hair Zinc 5-hydroxy indole acetic acid Norepinephrine

In recent years, research on the damaging effect of excess fluoride on children's soft tissue has steadily expanded, but studies related to the effects on the central nervous system, particularly the effects on mental work capacity, have been rare, and conclusions varied. One study^[1] of children from an area with fluoride-contaminated drinking water showed that high levels (0.5-7.3 mg/L) had no major effect on brain function. Other studies^[2,3] have pointed out that high intake of fluoride has a negative effect on the brains of animals and humans, and that a brain system in the process of development is one of the easiest targets for the toxic effects of fluoride. However presently there is very little research on the mechanisms involved in brain damage caused by fluoride poisoning. Through observation of the effects of different levels of fluoride intake on child mental work capacity (MWC), hair zinc levels, and their connection, and experimentation to determine the effects of high fluoride intake on 5-hydroxy indole acetic acid (5-HIAA) and Norepinephrine (NE) levels in the brain, the authors' aim is to expand on previous work showing the effects of excess fluoride on brain function, and do a preliminary investigation into the mechanisms involved as they relate to trace elements and neurotransmitters.

1. Subjects and Methods

1.1 Subjects

All the human subjects in the study were 12-13 year-old children from centralized

middle schools of two neighboring townships¹ in a coal-burning, fluorosis endemic area. After the group was sifted to remove children who had other acute or chronic diseases not related to fluoride, the number of subjects remaining for the study was 157. The two townships had identical fluoride levels in their drinking water (0.3 mg/L), and the fluoride content of the air was measured at 0.02-0.56 mg/m³. Excess fluoride exposure was primarily a result of the burning of high-fluoride coal to cook grains. Since some villages use firewood for fuel and the method of cooking varies, the level of fluoride contamination also shows variation. However, from the perspective of economic and cultural status, lifestyle, dietary habits, and the basic constituents of their food, the villages in the study were essentially the same. Sub-groups within the subject group were formed based on the presence of dental fluorosis and the fluoride content of their grain, as below:

Control group: no dental fluorosis, average fluoride content of grain = 0.5 mg/kg. High fluoride group I (HF I): no dental fluorosis, average fluoride content of grain = 4.7 mg/kg. High fluoride group II (HF II): dental fluorosis present (class 3), average fluoride content of grain = 5.3 mg/kg. High fluoride group III (HF III): dental fluorosis present (class 3) average fluoride content of grain = 31.6 mg/kg. The age, gender, and grade level composition of each group were kept as constant as possible.

1.2 Methods and content

Dental fluorosis was classified according to the three-class system. For the food-related part of the study, a combination of questionnaires and weighing was used, and the fluoride content of the food was measured using the acid-immersion electrode test. The zinc hair test was conducted according to requirements which asked all subjects in a particular village to provide a specimen, then from that 2-3 samples were randomly chosen and atomic absorption spectrometry was used to determine the zinc content. A hemoglobin ferricyanide test was used to determine the hemoglobin count. A proofing test² was used to determine the number of letters found (NLF), the rate of error (RE), and the index of mental capacity (IMC). A task involving twenty groups of three-digit numbers to be written in reverse order from memory was used to determine short-term memory capacity (SMC). An automated testing apparatus measured visual reaction time (RT).

In the long-term laboratory experiment, the subjects were wistar rats with an average weight of 72.8±4.2g. Rats were randomly selected to be part of the control (14 rats eating their usual diet), test group 1 (14 rats, 45 days of exposure) or test group 2 (24 rats, 12 weeks of exposure). The test groups had fluoride mixed into their regular feed at a concentration of (300 mg/kg). The rats were free to consume food and water (0.6 mg/L fluoride) as they pleased. At the end of the experimental period the rats' brains were removed and examined, the 5-HIAA and NE content measured by means of a Daojin RT-510 fluorospectrophotometer.

2. Results

2.1 The relation between child fluoride intake and MWC

¹ A township is a rural administrative unit between a county and a village

² This timed (2 minute) test of cognitive skill involves searching a table for given letters and crossing them out.

In table 1 below, HF II and HF III show a lower NLF and IMC score when compared to the HF I and the control. HF II showed a lower SMC score compared to the HF I and the control and the SMC of HF III was lower than HF I. Although there was no statistically significant differences between the four groups with regards to reaction time, if subjects without dental fluorosis (the control and HF I) are grouped (average RT 466.4 ms) and the subjects with level 3 dental fluorosis (HF II and HF III) are grouped (average RT 495.0 ms), the time difference becomes fairly significant ($P < 0.5$). There were no significant differences between the control and HF I, or between HF II and HF III for any of the indices.

Table 1: Comparison of Mental Work Capacity Between Different Groups

Group	RT(ms)		SMC (No.)		NLF (letters/ 2m)		RE (%)		IMC	
	n	$\bar{x} \pm s$	n	$\bar{x} \pm s$	n	$\bar{x} \pm s$	n	$\bar{x} \pm s$	n	$\bar{x} \pm s$
Control	51	463.0±93.9	49	17.2±2.9	49	555.2±79.5	49	0.5±0.4	49	267.2±39.5
HF I	33	471.7±77.4	31	18.6±2.0	33	569.1±96.6	33	0.5±0.4	33	273.2±50.2
HF II	37	494.5±68.4	38	15.6±4.1* [^]	38	507.4±66.3** ^{^^}	38	0.6±0.6	38	243.2±36.2** ^{^^}
HF III	36	495.6±99.2	36	16.6±3.0 [^]	36	500.0±73.7** ^{^^}	36	0.5±0.4	36	240.0±30.8** ^{^^}

RT: Reaction Time SMC: Short-term memory capacity NLF: Number of letters found RE: Rate of Error
 compared with control, ** $P < 0.01$ * $P < 0.05$ Compared with HF I group [^] $P < 0.05$ ^{^^} $P < 0.01$

2.2 The relationship between child fluoride intake and hair zinc

In table 2 below, the average hair zinc of HF II and HF III is markedly lower than the average of HF I and the control, however if any of the high fluoride groups is compared with the control, the difference is not statistically significant.

The levels of zinc in the soil of the two townships were tested to be 96.3 ± 37.7 mg/kg and 104.6 ± 57.7 mg/kg; the difference is not significant. Each group's diet was simple and essentially the same, with the daily intake of nutrition approximately the same, and there were no significant differences in hemoglobin levels. Therefore, any difference in hair zinc was not due to the soil or the diet.

Table 2: Comparison of hair zinc in different groups($\mu\text{g/g}$)

Group	n	Hair Zinc ($\bar{x} \pm s$)
Control	49	174.8 ± 30.7
HF I	31	181.5 ± 34.1
HF II	36	$142.6 \pm 41.8^*$
HF III	34	$152.9 \pm 35.2^*$

$F = 9.85, P < 0.01$

Comparison with control and HF 1 group, * $P < 0.01$

2.3 Relation of hair zinc and fluoride content of food with MWC

A multifactor correlative analysis yielded the following results: when the fluoride content of the food (FF) is held constant, high zinc is directly correlated with SMC, NLF, and IMC, and if zinc is held constant, the various indices of FF and MWC show no linear relation. This demonstrates that hair zinc and MWC are directly correlated, so if hair zinc levels increase, so does MWC, while levels of FF have no direct relation to MWC.

Table 3: Correlative Analysis of Hair Zinc (X1), FF (X2) and MWC(Y)

MWC	n	R	r(Y1,2)	R(Y2.1)
RT	142	0.1763*	0.1708*	0.0236
SMC	142	0.3317*	0.3263*	0.1092
NLF	142	0.2459*	0.2378*	0.0355
IMC	142	0.2478*	0.2381*	0.0419

* $P < 0.01$

2.4 The relation between high fluoride intake and neurotransmitters

As table 4 shows, test group 2 had reduced levels of 5-HIAA when compared to both test group 1 and the control, and test group 2 NE levels were elevated compared to test group 1 and the control. The differences between test group 1 and the control for either index were not significant.

Table 4: Comparison of Neurotransmitters in Different Groups of Rats

Group	5-HIAA		NE	
	n	$\bar{x} \pm s$	n	$\bar{x} \pm s$
Control	14	656 ± 136.7	13	245.0 ± 148.1
Test 1	14	655.9 ± 114.0	13	209.4 ± 103.1
Test 2	14	570.8 ± 109.8* [^]	22	344.0 ± 137.2* ^{^^}

5-HIAA = 5-hydroxy indole acetic acid, NE = Norepinephrine

$F_{5-HIAA} = 3.53$ $P < 0.05$, $F_{NE} = 4.89$ $P < 0.05$

Compared with control group, * $P < 0.05$

Compared with test group 1, [^] $P < 0.05$ ^{^^} $P < 0.01$

3. Discussion

Dental fluorosis is universally acknowledged as the earliest clinical manifestation of endemic, chronic fluoride poisoning, and is thought generally to result from high fluoride uptake before the age of 7 or 8 (i.e. early childhood). The subjects of this study were 12-13 year-old children, so those with dental fluorosis can be regarded as having a history of early, excess fluoride intake, and because the fluoride poisoning of this region is primarily a result of using coal fires to toast grains, the fluoride content of those grains will generally reflect the relative proportion of recent intake. Therefore having dental fluorosis indicates prolonged high fluoride intake, and eating high fluoride food indicates recent high-fluoride intake.

As shown in this study, the mental work capacity of the two groups with level 3 dental fluorosis was lower than the two groups with no dental fluorosis. Although the high-fluoride food eaten by both HF I and HF II suggested recent fluoride intake, only HF II had level 3 dental fluorosis and showed a corresponding drop in MWC compared to HF I. This indicates that early, long-term exposure to excess fluoride causes deficits in memory, attention, and reaction time, but 12-13 year-old children with only recent exposure show no major effects. Experiments^[3] have already shown that the developing brain is one of the ripest targets for disruption by fluoride poisoning. Given that before six years of age the human brain is in its fastest stage of development, and that around seven and eight basic structural development is completed, therefore the brain is most vulnerable to damage from excess fluoride intake before this age.

This study showed that the hair zinc of level 3 dental fluorosis patients was lower than those without dental fluorosis. Krishnamachari^[4] has reported the serum zinc of fluorosis patients significantly reduced when compared to a control. This indicates that long-term high fluoride intake can reduce the body levels of zinc, likely a case of absorption antagonism between the two trace elements. Further analysis reveals that MWC's relation to hair zinc and to recent intake from contaminated grain is almost identical. However, the results of a multifactor correlative analysis show that in fact MWC is correlated directly with hair zinc, showing no significant correlation with the fluoride content of subject's food. This indicates that long-term high fluoride intake interferes with zinc metabolism, and it is only after zinc is reduced that MWC is negatively affected. One report^[5] finds that hair zinc and IQ are directly correlated. On the whole, this suggests that inference with zinc metabolism caused by prolonged intake of excess fluoride leading to lowered levels of zinc in the body is perhaps one of the mechanisms by which fluoride affects MWC.

Similarly, the experimental results show that high fluoride intake over long periods lead to decreased levels of 5-HIAA and elevated levels of NE, while rats exposed to fluoride over shorter periods showed no corresponding change. 5-HIAA is the primary product of 5-hydroxytryptamine (5-HT) metabolism, so it can reflect the metabolic status of 5-HT. Under normal circumstances, cerebral 5-HT and NE are deactivated by monoamine oxidase. Zavoronkov^[6] points out that high fluoride can cause 5-HT and NE to become inactive, leading to decrease of 5-HIAA and an increase of NE. Geetaert^[7] points out in rats with high fluoride intake both 5-HT and 5-HIAA are reduced, indicating that fluoride can become a barrier to the production of 5-HT in the brain. Others report^[8] that in animal experiments a lack of zinc can lead to an increase in NE. This connects directly with what was observed in the present study, i.e. long-term fluoride intake correlated with a drop in hair zinc, and is quite possibly the reason for the increase in NE. 5-HT and NE are important

neurotransmitters, vital in maintaining the balance between excitation and inhibition during high-level central nervous function, so the elevation of 5-HT together with the reduction of NE could lead to over-stimulated brains showing poor performance in tasks that involve attention and memory. *Russian Name*^[9] had a similar finding. Therefore, high fluoride intake interfering with the metabolism of 5-HT and NE is another possible mechanism for diminished MWC. Further experimental research should be done to investigate this.

* * *

The authors would like to give special thanks to assistant professor Dong Yunhua, as well as colleagues Li Dashen and Hong Yuantong for their assistance

References

1. Cheng Zhi et al 1989. An epidemiological study to determine amounts for endemic fluoride poisoning. *Chinese Journal of Control of Endemic Diseases*, 4(1): 18.
2. Guan Zhizhong 1968. Changes in brain morphology in the offspring of chronically fluoride poisoned rats. *Chinese Journal of Pathology*, 15(4): 297.
3. He Han et al 1989. The effects of fluoride on human fetuses. *Chinese Journal of Control of Endemic Diseases*, 4(3): 136.
4. Krishnamachari KAVR 1982. Trace elements in serum and bone endemic goiter: a manifestation of chronic fluoride toxicity. *Fluoride*, 15(1): 25.
5. Lu Zizhi 1990. The status of child hygienic research in China. *Chinese Journal of School Health*, 11(2): 3.
6. Editorial Review 1978. Nonskeletal Fluorosis. *Fluoride*, 11(3): 111.
7. Geeraerts, F et al 1981. Effect of administration of sodium fluoride on urinary excretion of tryptophan metabolites. *Fluoride*, 14 (4): 155.
8. Ramadath DD (Translated by Xu Guanglu) 1990. Iron and intellectual function. *Foreign Medical Sciences (Section of Medgeography)*. 11(3): 135
9. *Russian*

(Draft Received 03/16/1993) Cheng Songtao, Editor
(Translated 02/24/2007) Julian Brooke, Translator